

PUBLIC MEETING MINUTES



HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

March 13th, 2019

Hatton Hall
34 E 7th Street
Tempe, AZ 85281

6:00 PM

Commission Present:

Chuck Buss, Chair
Matthew Bilsbarrow
Jim Garrison
Gregory Larson
Laurene Montero
Joe Nucci
Elizabeth Gilbert

Commission Absent:

Marty Ball, Vice-Chair
Chris Garraty

City Staff Present:

John Larsen Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Robbie Aaron
Alex Smith
Brittainy Nelson
Steve Abrahamson

Chair Buss called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

1. Call to Audience:

2. **Approval of January 9th, 2019 meeting minutes**

Commissioner Bilsbarrow moved the Commission approve the January 9th, 2019 minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Garrison and passed with a vote of 7-0.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci, Elizabeth Gilbert

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Marty Ball, Chris Garraty

3. **Approval of February 13th, 2019 meeting minutes**

Commissioner Nucci moved the Commission approve the February 13th, 2019 minutes. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Larson and passed with a vote of 7-0.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci, Elizabeth Gilbert

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Marty Ball, Chris Garraty

4. Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of communications equipment and associated infrastructure from the peak of **TEMPE (HAYDEN) BUTTE** located at 2222 East 5th Street. The applicant is the City of Tempe.

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commission that there was a grant to remove the communication tower to the Salt River and Pima Indian Community. The tower has been there for several decades which also holds a broadcast house. In which the Salt River Valley water usage association built on top after requiring a 1949 easement. Allowing them to do this in exchange for them providing power to the festive displays that remain on the Butte. In the past few years all the equipment on the Butte that belonging to the association, the district, along with all the other entities that held equipment on the Butte was removed. Founding for the remove of the tower has been secured and the tower is set for removal. The broadcast house was set as a contributing feature to the tower. It was believed to be a sturdier material like concert but has been determined that it is primally lath and plaster and will likely damaged in the removal of the tower. Plus, the pima Indian community did request of all the equipment and infrastructure to be removed.

Commission Discussion

Chair Chuck Buss asked is there any restoration that needs to be done.

Mr. Smith informed the Chair Buss that the tower does set on a thick set of concrete and the plan is to gently jackhammer the concrete and get down to the base of the material of the mountain as possible.

Chair Chuck Buss said that sounds good he just doesn't want to see them go to deep and cause damage.

Mr. Smith stated that the staff is aware of the importance of the native material and will try as hard as possible not to disturb it too much.

Chair Buss acknowledged commissioner bilsbarrow.

Commissioner Bilsbarrow asked if the fence will be removed.

Mr. Smith stated yes it will be removed also the poles will be removed and/or trimmed down to a maintainable level in terms of two feet off the ground. The main upraise for the festive displays will be removed leaving the selves in place after the take down of the upraise. The only thing left behind will be an equipment box.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Commissioner Larson moved that the Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for removal of communications equipment and associated infrastructure from the peak of **TEMPE (HAYDEN) BUTTE** located at 2222 East 5th Street. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gilbert and passed with a vote of 7-0.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci, Elizabeth Gilbert

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Marty Ball, Chris Garraty

-
5. Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an Amended Planned Area Development Overlay and a Development Plan Review for **FARMER GOODWIN TOWNHOMES** located at 830 South Farmer Avenue consisting of a new ten (10) unit 3-story townhome development. The applicant is Crew Development Corporation.

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

This case was originally heard back in February of 2017 in which it was approved with a condition by the historic preservation commission. The condition that the commission was seeking was that the facade conservation easement for the Farmer Goodwin house that was a condition of approval for the 2005 planned area of development. Since the last hearing this has been received and recorded with the County. However, it is stated that the HPC approvals are only valid for one year.

Presentation from Applicant: Crew Development Corporation

The project consists of two buildings with ten townhomes that are three stories. The intent is to minimize the impact of the Farmer Goodwin house there was nothing done to block the view. The design provides diversity and use of articular elements. The design does provide shade to encourage pedestrian access. There is very little existing landscape. The plan is to keep what is currently there and add more to the project site. The central courtyard is a residential drive for the residence but with a use of materials and pedestrian scaling. The stamped concrete will be in place to give a pedestrian scale there are doors to the North and the South perimeter with sidewalks leading to the street to encourage pedestrian access to the major roads. Along Farmer there is an arch element to give some character and to define the center of the building. It will also give it a pedestrian scale with the thought that a vehicle driving through the arch will have a feeling that they are driving into a residential area and slow down. Along 9th avenue, which are the ends to the east and west of the property, those units will have a door directly on to the sidewalk. The east side of the homes will also connect the Farmer Ave sidewalk. The building being developed to the north of the Farmer Goodwin home is close to the historic zone. A few things that the last commission asked to have changed was the small windows that were in the bathroom which were removed. The overhang in the balcony to the east of the property facing Farmer had the dormers removed. The elevation is the same even without the dormers and windows.

Commission Discussion

Chair Buss wanted to know if the dormers were staying he liked the original look of them.

The applicant said that he would be willing to add them back in depending on what the commissioners wanted.

Chair Buss wanted to know if they could change the look of the archway so that it has a softer look.

The applicant said that they are using simple forms in layering as a way of incorporating some of the metal to tie the details together.

Chair Buss said that he would like to see something more like two columns to the left and the right and then a

simple line if need be to tie in the look rather than a flat top look that doesn't seem as stark. Looking for something more inviting.

Chair Buss acknowledged commissioner Nucci.

Commissioner Nucci stated that in the Staff report conditions of approval are recommending that in addition to the dormers they are also looking to recover the windows that were removed from the previous elevations and the Cam lighting has not been satisfactory selective.

Mr. Southard stated that is correct and the reason for that condition is to mirror what is conditionally approved in 2017 the windows the dormers and the cam lighting not having a tear sheath the staff wanted to make sure they had some involvement in that selection process.

Commissioner Nucci gave the conditions of approvals are dormers as depicted in 2017 submittal to be added to the east elevation two recesses LED cam lighting shall require a certificate of no affect prior to installation three window size and placement on the north end elevation of the north building to be as depicted in the 2017 submittal.

Commissioner Nucci stated that the city will be living up to the agreement if meet the three conditions

Chair Buss asked if Mr. Southard could read the first conditions of approval

Mr. Southard stated that the suggested condition of approval is dormers as depicted in 2017 submittal to be added to the east.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Commissioner Nucci moved the Commission approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for an Amended Planned Area Development Overlay and a Development Plan Review for **FARMER GOODWIN TOWNHOMES** located at 830 South Farmer Avenue consisting of a new ten (10) unit 3-story townhome development. The motion was seconded by Commissioner Gilbert and passed with a vote of 6-1.

Ayes: Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci, Elizabeth Gilbert

Nays: Chuck Buss

Abstain: None

Absent: Marty Ball, Chris Garraty

6. Discussion of Tempe Municipal Building Council Chambers update Concepts

Presentation from John Dick

The northwest corner of the garden level will have a new set of restrooms that are ADA compliant. The space where the current bathrooms are in will become part of the new security station. The formal entry that comes down the center and lines up with the steps leading out to the street will be used for non-council events or events that do not require security and will remain as an exit. Those details are still being worked out with the Tempe Police Department and Security Staff. The front North end of the Council side will extend out to the north towards the stair way and leave plenty of room for circulation. The plan is to take the floor out and give it a ramped floor that is ADA compliant and not as steep as the current flooring. There will be video screens on the back wall behind council members and in different locations throughout the chambers in the ceiling going back through the audience. There is going to be faux-wood paneling throughout the chambers. There will be some landscape modifications done to the court yard as well to comply with the new look of the chambers. There will be power to some of the seats so that one could plug in devices to charge. The walls on the side will be absorbent as you move towards the rear. The ceiling will be an acoustical USG product to help with sound.

Commission Discussion

Chair Huss commented that he enjoys the fact that the time period of the space is taken into evaluation.

Commissioner Larson asked what the life span of the faux-wood is.

Mr. Dick stated that it is a good 40-year product however it has not been finalized yet that are going to use that material.

Commissioner Larson also asked what would happen once you end the life span of the faux-wood.

Mr. Dick stated that it is a material that can be taken down and be replaced or maybe at a time there is a whole new idea and the product goes away all together because there is a new idea of how they want the chambers to look.

7. Charles T. Hayden House Update

Mr. Southard gave a brief update of what has been going on at the Hayden House. Mr. Southard stated that there is exposed historic adobe and to the west of the north end of the elevation there has been repairs done to the home. It is fortunate that as of right now the entry of the adobe is in fairly good shape. There is a mix in terms of age with the adobe you have some red brick and some sand tan. Due to this it will have a slightly different paint color to ensure that it is distinct. The bricks in the court yard will be removed to create an open courtyard feel. There is going to be an interview with the Arizona Republic on March 14, 2019 to discuss the updates as well. The video that was taken of the home has reached 350 thousand view between news channels and YouTube watchers.

8. Chair/ Staff Updates

Chair Buss did send a letter of support for the Sandra Day O' Connor House National Register Nomination.

305 S Roosevelt has a demolition request the City only had 30-day period to determine any other possible solutions besides demolition. There weren't any other alternates beyond demolition and the permit has been issued.

919 S Maple also had demolition done as of last April.

599 W 5th street is classified as historic optional and may be demolition. There is the option to buy the property and restore it.

March 30 Jacob and his team will be unveiling the artwork at the Hayden Flour Mill Saturday at 9am Council Members have been invited.

9. Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

In April the Council Chambers update may be coming back for approval.

Next meeting to be scheduled in April needs to be determined because some of the Commissioners are not going to be available on the original date.

Meeting adjourned at 7:05pm

Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson